TITLE: THE ENGLISH CLUB: MOSCOW'S REVIVAL OF EXCLUSIVE TRADITIONS

AUTHOR: HELENA GOSCILO, University of Pittsburgh

THE NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR EURASIAN AND EAST EUROPEAN RESEARCH

TITLE VIII PROGRAM

1755 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036
PROJECT INFORMATION:

CONTRACTOR: University of Pittsburgh
PRINCIPAL INVESTIGATOR: Helena Goscilo
COUNCIL CONTRACT NUMBER: 813-07g
DATE: February 10, 1998

COPYRIGHT INFORMATION

Individual researchers retain the copyright on their work products derived from research funded by contract or grant from the National Council for Eurasian and East European Research. However, the Council and the United States Government have the right to duplicate and disseminate, in written and electronic form, this Report submitted to the Council under this Contract or Grant, as follows: Such dissemination may be made by the Council solely (a) for its own internal use, and (b) to the United States Government (1) for its own internal use; (2) for further dissemination to domestic, international and foreign governments, entities and individuals to serve official United States Government purposes; and (3) for dissemination in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act or other law or policy of the United States Government granting the public rights of access to documents held by the United States Government. Neither the Council, nor the United States Government, nor any recipient of this Report by reason of such dissemination, may use this Report for commercial sale.

1 The work leading to this report was supported in part by contract or grant funds provided by the National Council for Eurasian and East European Research, made available by the U. S. Department of State under Title VIII (the Soviet-Eastern European Research and Training Act of 1983, as amended). The analysis and interpretations contained in the report are those of the author(s).
SUMMARY

The renowned English Club, founded in 1770 in St Petersburg and soon after also in Moscow, was the epitome of exclusiveness under tsarism, catering to an all-male membership drawn from the nation’s privileged classes, and the site of many colorful "gentlemanly" pastimes. By the early nineteenth century foreigners comprised a tiny minority within the club. World War I transformed half of the club’s quarters into a hospital, and, with the Soviets’ seizure of power, the club ceased to function altogether in 1918.

The club’s revival in the 1990s reflects the accelerating post-Soviet trend of recuperating elitist modes and civilized forms of social interaction. Fraternal enclaves modeled primarily on long-standing British traditions, and typically associated with "gentlemanly" sports and pursuits, range from the "gentlemen’s club" run by the Communist deputy Vladimir Semago, where members don evening dress to play billiards, to the Moscow Golf Club, where wealthy glitterati not only play, but also stage photoshoot charity events, such as "The Other Half" ("Vtoraia polovina") on 3 July 1997, which collected 30,480,000 rubles (approximately $5,440) for needy children. Whereas most of these institutions have organized around a single profession (e.g., the Film Club) or hobby, as under tsardom, the English Club deliberately emulates its predecessor’s centrifugal structure, cultivating a profile of diversification that safeguards against an identifiable political program and a perceived promotion of group-specific interests.

For the post-Soviet Russian, the English Club represents the paradise lost of self-assured patrician chic. The founders embraced the original club’s motto of "Concordia et laetitia" (Harmony and Pleasure) as a ruling principle uniting people from varied professions and different classes, joined by their common desire to socialize in comfort and engage in lively discussion. The club’s Board of Trustees, comprised chiefly of its founders, boasts some of the country’s most famous public figures in business, politics, art, and entertainment. Rank and file members include business moguls, chief editors of newspapers, media stars and academicians; and unlike its predecessor, the new English Club, with a membership of approximately 130, welcomes women.

In addition to routine social intercourse the Club holds a variety of gala events with resplendent dress, as well as intellectual activities such as its monthly discussions on currently relevant topics such as the perspectives for Russia’s development, entrepreneurship and political power, criminalization within the economy, the role of businesswomen, conflict of interest, morality and its compromise in business, and the relevance of education and culture. The Club’s role of social facilitator sometimes yields rapid and concrete philanthropic results.

Since desovietization, monarchists, religious fanatics, born-again Slavophiles, and kindred enthusiasts of nostalgia have rushed to reinstate rituals and establishments identified with the social

---

2 Compiled and edited by NCEEER Staff.
stratification of the pre-Soviet era. In order to assimilate the English Club into this self-promoting ideological trend, however, one would have to ignore not only the heterogeneity of the club's membership, but also its dominant motivation and goal as articulated by the club's spokesmen: to create in miniature a "model society of citizens" for others to emulate. The English Club looks beyond the immediate pragmatism of its members, cuts across class divisions, and does not confine its focus to a remote past in hopes of overcoming or obliterating more recent history. While sharing in the city's comprehensive campaign of aestheticization and recovery of gentility, the club seems genuinely involved in political life, social causes, and cultural development. It eschews identification with a single ideological stance and embraces diversity both in its admission policy and in its program of activities.

Conviviality, fine conversation, discussions of "big" issues, excellent food and drink, charitable deeds, an element of education, and entertainment, then, compose the club's immediate agenda-a blend that allies it with Western structures and institutions. Its long-range ideal of creating an exemplary social model, however, places the English Club squarely within the hardy Russian and Soviet tradition of utopia. Ultimately, only the future can clarify whether the club instantiates a solipsistic self-contradiction or a productive synthesis.
Birth and Death:

Low on funds, Leo Tolstoy in 1862 promised the publisher Mikhail Katkov his as yet unwritten novel *The Cossacks* in exchange for a loan to gamble there. During a cardgame at its tables, the wealthy banker Sergei Riabushinskii rashly staked and lost his favorite villa, The Black Swan, located in Petrovsky Park. Prince Golitsyn significantly upped the ante when he publicly offered his wife as collateral in a cardgame with Count Razumovskii, and was honor-bound to settle his debt. The site of these and similarly colorful "gentlemanly" pastimes was the renowned English Club, the epitome of exclusiveness under tsarism, catering to an all-male membership drawn from the nation's privileged classes.

The St. Petersburg branch of the English Club was founded by the British banker Francis Gardiner\(^3\) for fifty expatriate merchants in 1770 (Beeston). Its equivalent soon opened in Moscow—the first such social establishment in the city, attracting English, French, and Russian members. By the early nineteenth century, however, foreigners comprised a tiny minority within the club, causing A. Herzen to note that there was nothing whatever English about it (*Byloe i dumy*). World War I transformed half of the club's quarters into a hospital, and, with the Soviets' seizure of power, the club ceased to function altogether in 1918 (Giliarovskii 263).

During its heyday the pre-revolutionary English Club attracted the most newsworthy celebrities of both capitals. Its roster of luminaries boasted writers (Griboyedov, Boratynsky, Delvig, Karamzin, Krylov, Pushkin,\(^4\) Tolstoy, Turgenev, Zagoskin, and Zhukovsky), publishers (Katkov), state officials (Arakcheyev, Benkendorf, Speransky, the minister I. Dmitriev, senators S. Saltykov and P. Lopukhin, Count Potemkin), military leaders (Bagration, Ermolov, and Kutuzov), doctors (A. Al'fonskii), bankers (Riabushinskii), philosophers (P. Chadayev), and aristocrats (Catherine II's grandson, A. Bobrinskii, Prince V. Golitsyn). Membership figures ranged from 300 to 600,\(^5\) and some hopefuls waited up to fifteen years for acceptance. Women were excluded from the club, whose pleasures consisted principally of male camaraderie, worldly conversation, eating, drinking, and playing chess, billiards, and cards—with whist and preference as the games of choice. Reports of the high-ranking members' gambling and carousing in luxurious style captured nineteenth-century

---

\(^3\) According to Nabokov, the banker's name was Cornelius Gardiner and the St. Petersburg branch—officially called Angliiskoe sobranie—was far superior to the Moscow one. Nabokov 3: 118, 275.

\(^4\) Pushkin joined the club in 1832 and visited it regularly until his death in 1837.

\(^5\) According to Nabokov, the Moscow branch had approximately six hundred members by the 1820s, while membership at the more fashionable St. Petersburg ran to three hundred. Nabokov 3: 118.
readers' imaginations and enhanced the establishment's reputation for glamorous self-indulgence. Some wistfully mythologized it as a gourmet's and gamester's Eden.

The club, however, also fulfilled a more serious function in creating an environment for informal but influential debate among the nobility on a wide range of social and political issues. An impressive array of domestic and foreign newspapers could be perused in its comfortable reading area, and a special room ("govoril'nia") was set aside for conversation (Giliarovskii 252). Fostering unmonitored exchange of views among "the best minds of the time" in agreeable surroundings, the English Club was a synthesis of the modern age's golf course, cocktail party, and sports club, where polity and politesse converge. According to some, Nicholas I took into account the club's opinions on problems of state (Giliarovskii 253).

With British blue-blood urbanity and understated good taste as its approximate ideal, the club cultivated aristocratic leisure activities, while observing the principles of noblesse oblige. Accordingly, it contributed to various charities and took up causes deemed worthy by its members: its funds aided victims of the St. Petersburg floods, and its efforts played a decisive role in erecting the monument to Dmitrii Donskoi on Kulikovo Field. Pushkin's *Eugene Onegin* and Tolstoy's *War and Peace* immortalized the club as the zenith of social privilege and prestige, and in Russia's modern popular consciousness it came to symbolize a mythical Golden Age of irrecoverable stability and unimaginable affluence.

**Resurrection:**

The club's revival in the 1990s reflects the accelerating post-Soviet trend of recuperating elitist modes and civilized forms of social interaction. Fraternal enclaves modeled primarily on long-standing British traditions, and typically associated with "gentlemanly" sports and pursuits, range from the "gentlemen's club" run by the Communist deputy Vladimir Semago, where members don evening dress to play billiards (Economist 53), to the Moscow Golf Club, where wealthy glitterati not only play, but also stage photo-op charity events, such as "The Other Half" ("Vtoraia polovina") on 3 July 1997, which collected 30,480,000 rubles (approximately $5,440) for needy children (Ozerova 11). Whereas most of these institutions have a centripetal basis, organized around a single profession (e.g., the Film Club) or hobby, as under tsardom, the English Club deliberately emulates its predecessor's centrifugal structure, cultivating a profile of diversification that safeguards against an identifiable political program and a perceived promotion of group-specific interests.

---

6 The memoirs of the journalist Vladimir Giliarovskii (1853-1935), a major source of information about the club, emphasize its hedonistic aspects.

7 In *Anna Karenina*, however, Tolstoy refers to the club as a "temple of idleness" ("khram prazdnosti"). For literati's opinions on the club, see Giliarovskii, *passim*.

8 For information about the Hunters' Club, for example, see Giliarovskii, "Okhotnichii klub," 239-46.
For the post-Soviet Russian, the English Club represents the paradise lost of self-assured patrician chic. According to Elena Tsygankova, the press secretary of its current reincarnation, the idea of resuscitating the club occurred simultaneously to several like-thinking individuals in the mid-1990s. They embraced the original club's motto of "Concordia et laetitia" (Harmony and Pleasure) as a ruling principle uniting people from varied professions and different classes, joined by their common desire to socialize in comfort and engage in lively discussion."9

At its official opening in May 1996, accompanied by a lavish ceremony during which founding members toasted each other with the club's traditional foxberry liqueur, the organization adopted the name of the Moscow Executive Club. In 1997, however, it finally acquired permission to use the old, association-steeped name of the English Club. Located at the business center of the Russian Chamber of Commerce on Chistoprudny Boulevard, it continues its negotiations with the city to transfer its headquarters to the club's historic site—the former Museum of Revolution on Tverskaya Boulevard. The club's determination to be recognized as rightful heir to the original English Club (in its own words, "preemnik Moskovskogo Angliiskogo kluba")10 typifies the current tendency to seek cultural legitimation via a pre-Soviet aristocratic lineage.

Who's Who:

The club's Board of Trustees, comprised chiefly of its founders, boasts some of the country's most famous public figures in business, politics, art, and entertainment: Sergei Abakumov, President of the stock company ABAS International, Aleksandr Shirvindt, one of Russia's most renowned actors (the Board's Vice President); Stanislav Smirnov, President of the Chamber of Commerce; and Stanislav Shatalin, President of the international Reform Foundation. Members of the governing board include the club's President, Oleg Matveyev, who heads the commercial/financial group M-PLUS; Artyom Borovik, TV host and chief executive of the information and publishing center Top Secret; Mikhail Ulíanov, head of the Union of Theater Artists; film director Eldar Riazanov; composer Yurii Saulsky; Elena Pogorelova, President of the business company ELSI; Iosif Ordzhonikidze, Vice Premier of the Moscow government; Lev Rokhlin, President of the Duma Committee on Defense; the hockey player Vladislav Tretyak and Aleksandr Tikhonov, three-time and four-time Olympic champions; ageless folk singer Liudmila Gurchenko; polar explorer and Duma Vice President Artur Chilingarov; Viktor Sadovichny, Provost of Moscow State University; Bolshoi Theater singer Zurab Sotkilava; Elena Chaikovskaya, chief trainer of Russia's figure skating team; and Vitaly Smirnov, President of Russia's Olympic Committee.

9 Information gleaned from interview with Tsygankova and from material prepared for press releases.
The club has also revived the old rank of starshina—traditionally, the leader of a community or the foreman of a jury—conferred either upon "older and wiser" members who fulfill the role of advisors or witty individuals adept at hosting sumptuous gatherings. Moscow Mayor Luzhkov, one of the club’s honorary members, belongs to this elect body of sages and entertainers, as do the lawyer Nikolai Klen and the actor/director Shirvindt.

Rank and file members include business moguls, such as Pyotr Avin, president of Alpha-Bank. Yuri Boikov, President of AOZT "Union-Alpha," Andrey Iliopulo, head of Econika, Yuri Senin, General Director of Cat Software Ltd., Sergei Bagayev, President of the Moscow Association of Realtors and Director of the real estate company Babylon, and Andrei Gusarov, President of the construction company Satori; chief editors of newspapers, such as Muladzhanov of Komsomolskaia pravda and Vitaly Tret’iakov of Nezavisimaja gazeta; media stars, and academicians (e.g., historian Igor Abylgazyev). Unlike its predecessor, the new English Club, with a membership of approximately 130, welcomes women: in addition to Gurchenko, Chaikovskaiia, and Pogorela, lesser-known but eminently successful female members include theater and film designer Alla Kozhenkova, TV executive Iren Lesnevskaiia, Elena Andreyeva, owner of the security agency Bastion, and Irina Belikova, Vice President of the tour agency Rantek International.

Where and What:
Those aspiring to join may be recommended by full-fledged members or submit an application. In either case they must undergo a rigorous two-week screening process, partly intended to weed out candidates with criminal ties or ideological axes to grind. The annual membership fee of $7,000 for those who pass muster entitles them to full participation in activities orchestrated by the club, to which they may invite personal guests. Since most members take advantage of that option, attendance at galas and festive gatherings averages 250 people.

Prosperity is a significant, but not exclusive, criterion for membership, and particularly desirable but less moneyed applicants reportedly negotiate reduced fees. Through its Executive Service the club provides what in the Russian context are extraordinary benefits—for a commensurate price. By purchasing the Union Card at Orgbank, members obtain access to private doctors and lawyers, as well as to car mechanics, plumbers, handymen, babysitters, and cleaning women, all top quality and ready to furnish prompt and expert professional aid around the clock. Moreover, at an unspecified cost, the club’s staff arranges accommodations, vacations, schooling, and business trips (Business in Russia) for subscribers to the Executive Service. In short, the Union Card is a passport to the comfort and security of privileged, first class service. And companies compete for the publicized honor of selling their expertise to the club.

Doubtless partly owing to Mayor Luzhkov's role of honorary starshina, the English Club was designated a social ("obshchestvennaia") organization of Moscow, entrusted with familiarizing foreign officials with the program of festivities planned for the 850th anniversary jubilee in September 1997. This "orientation," attended by ambassadors, cultural attachés, and kindred representatives, took the form of a reception in the "Friendship" ("Druzhba") house in April 1997, and eased the organization toward formalizing its status as the English Club.

An efficient team of imaginative and energetic staff personnel coordinates the club's agenda. Its calendar of social events includes initiation ceremonies for new members; dinners at the city's premier restaurants (e.g., the Metropol and the Peking); special exhibits, such as that devoted to the ballerina Elena Maksimova (Chesnokova); presentations of rare and valuable objects (e.g., the fine porcelain by the supplier of china to the British royal family, displayed to members at the luxurious "old style" French restaurant Club T); private sales (e.g., Nina Ricci jewelry); a showing of Alla Pugachova's new boot collection from her shoe line, at the Luxor Club in the Metropol Hotel; parties and balls (e.g., a New Year's masked ball); excursions that blend cultural refinement with culinary delights and a festive atmosphere (e.g., a nostalgic trip by motorboat to Serebrianyi Bor in the Green Zone, to hear old romances sung by local gypsies); and "surprise" evenings, at which the assembled are treated to something unexpected by a fellow member or an unannounced guest. On International Women's Day (March 8), the club exhibited and made available for purchase Hollywood jewelry and hats designed by Irina Belopukhova. Since headwear for Soviet women traditionally has favored kerchiefs, this occasion symptomatized the club's general desire to influence fashion through stylish example: observing a formal dress code for most events, the club encourages participants in special evenings to wear tuxedos and resplendent gowns rarely seen outside the theater (Tsygankova).

A gathering on 27 August 1997, commemorating the 225th anniversary of the English Club at its traditional location on the impressively refurbished Tverskaya Street, drew a huge crowd of spectators who peered curiously through the railing at the evening's entertainment. In addition to several speeches, a live band playing mainly Western tunes, and the ritual ceremony welcoming new members, invitees and their guests toured Museum rooms housing relics from the old English Club—rooms renovated with money contributed by a group of current club members. Apart from its pedagogical value, the occasion, which was televised, had its playful moments. Passersby particularly relished the spectacle of a horse and open carriage pulling up at the gates and depositing three men dressed as Pushkin, Kutuzov, and Napoleon, who presented their invitations to the guards.

---

12 This event, like everything connected with Pugachova, received wide coverage in virtually all the glossies and popular magazines, under such headings as "Pugacheva obuet vsiu stranu" (Aledina 4). See also Ogonek, Litsa, etc. for that month.

13 The brass band regaled members with numbers from My Fair Lady, "When you are in love," and the like.
checking the guest list at the entrances to the Museum grounds. The unchallenged highlight of the evening, however, was the stirring sight of Mayor Luzkhov throwing caution and age to the winds as he danced with gypsies.\textsuperscript{14}

A more intellectual aspect of the club's activities is the discussion club overseen by the political scientist Professor Aleksey Kara-Murza, who presides over monthly discussions on currently relevant topics: the perspectives for Russia's future development, entrepreneurship and political power, criminalization within the economy, and the like. On the anniversary of Peter the Great's birthday in May 1997, some members of the discussion group flew to St. Petersburg to join the celebrations, and in the course of events inspired the "other" city to resuscitate its branch of the English Club (Tsygankova). And on 23 October, 1997 the club addressed a controversial issue passionately debated in both the Russian and the Western press: "The Psychology of Behavior of the New Russian Entrepreneur." Formal presentations were followed by a free question and answer period and lively debate among the club's members, guests, and journalists. The proceedings touched on the role of businesswomen in the New Russia, links between business and politics, conflict of interest as a phenomenon requiring acknowledgement, morality and its compromise or absence in Russian business today, the relevance of education and culture to business.\textsuperscript{15}

The club's role of social facilitator sometimes yields rapid, concrete results of a philanthropic nature.\textsuperscript{16} For instance, two Latvian fans of Boris Pasternak--a banker and a poet/ambassador--met each other through the club, and with its cooperation restored Pasternak's house/museum in Peredelkino, simultaneously arranging long-term financial support for its personnel. Likewise, the club organizes concerts, donating the proceeds to charities or to historical jubilees, such as the 850th anniversary of Moscow. For undertakings of this sort, the club's status proves a drawing card, enabling it to attract such stars as dancer Maya Plisetskaia and singer Lev Leshchenko, who readily perform for "the cause."

To inscribe and broadcast its presence, under the directorship of Artyom Borovik, host of the TV show "Top Secret" and head of the paper by the same name, the club publishes its own monthly magazine, \textit{Persona (Litsa)}. Inaugurated at the Peking restaurant in November 1996, though registered on 30 January, 1996, with Grigorii Nekhoroshev as chief editor, it comes out in a run of 50,000 copies (printed in Finland, but published by Top Secret), and may be purchased at newsstands. The printrun reflects the expectation of a sizable readership, and the magazine's 66

\textsuperscript{14} Gypsy songs and dances, of course, constituted an entire subculture among producers of nineteenth-century culture, as attested by memoirs and literature of the period.

\textsuperscript{15} Transcript of the meeting ("Stenogramma zasedaniia Diskussionnogo kluba: "Psikhologiiia povedeniia novogo rossiiskogo predprinimatelia") 23 October 1997. Probably intentionally, the use of "rossiiskii" instead of "russkii" in the title discouraged participants from equating all post-Soviet businessmen with the hackneyed image of the vulgar, brassy, crime-implicated New Russians.

\textsuperscript{16} Charitable contributions in Russia, unlike in the United States, are fully taxable.
colorful, glossy pages feature club news (in an insert labeled "Moskovskie litsa"), interviews, book reviews, and sundry items comparable to those routinely carried in unaffiliated glossies. Moreover, the club preserves a large selection of photographs taken by professionals at its publicized events, and intends not only to produce a film about itself, but, eventually, to have its own TV show. In short, the club has mapped out an advertising campaign for establishing its identity as a key actor in the capital’s social and cultural life.

Mien and Meaning:

Skeptics might wax ironic about the revival of the English Club, especially in light of Moscow’s recent wholesale restoration of not only ancient buildings but also tsarist traditions and institutions erased by the Soviet regime. Intent on leaving his indelible mark on Russia’s capital, Major Luzhkov has spearheaded the drive to transform Moscow into a showplace, restoring and expanding pre-Revolutionary architectural structures, completely refurbishing the Manege, introducing up-scale malls, and beautifying the city. Since desovietization, monarchists, religious fanatics, born-again Slavophiles, and kindred enthusiasts of nostalgia have rushed to reinstate rituals and establishments identified with the social stratification of the pre-Soviet era. In order to assimilate the English Club into this self-promoting ideological trend, however, one would have to ignore not only the heterogeneity of the club’s membership, but also its dominant motivation and goal as articulated by the club’s spokesmen: to create in miniature a “model society of citizens” for others to emulate. Unlike the Nobles’ Club, founded by the impoverished scions of the old Russian aristocracy and headed by Prince Andrey Golitsyn, the English Club looks beyond the immediate pragmatism of its members, cuts across class divisions, and does not confine its focus to a remote past in hopes of overcoming or obliterating more recent history. While sharing in the city’s comprehensive campaign of aestheticization and recovery of gentility, the club seems genuinely involved in political life, social causes, and cultural development. It eschews identification with a single ideological stance and embraces diversity both in its admission policy (it encourages non-Russian applicants) and in its program of activities.

Items published in the press suggest that Muscovites perceive the club without suspicion or resentment. While that state of affairs may be partly explained by the club’s wisdom in inviting journalists, as well as the mayor, to their evenings and outings, an informal, random canvassing of “average” Russians, ranging from cabdrivers and cashiers to academics, yielded little negative

---

17 To showcase his fiefdom, Luzhkov cannily proclaimed the 850th anniversary of the city as a significant milestone, which afforded the opportunity to display the miraculous metamorphosis of the capital into a vital, glittering metropolis. Few Muscovites protested the expenditure of millions of dollars on this media event, while repairs and extension of the Moscow subway were suspended for "lack of funds."
commentary about the club; the interviewees deemed it original and *sui generis* ("svoeobraznyi"). 18

Two representatives of the intelligentsia expressed what may be viewed either as frank moral reservations or as disguised envy of the members' affluence: they noted that the money spent on frivolities might be used more beneficially to help those living below the poverty line. The same, of course, could be said of any funds expended on non-essentials.

Conviviality, fine conversation, discussions of "big" issues, excellent food and drink, charitable deeds, an element of education, and entertainment, then, compose the club's immediate agenda—a blend that allies it with Western structures and institutions. Its long-range ideal of creating an exemplary social model, however, places the English Club squarely within the hardy Russian and Soviet tradition of utopia. Ultimately, only the future can clarify whether the club instantiates a solipsistic self-contradiction or a productive synthesis.

Helena Goscilo
University of Pittsburgh
September-October 1997
Revised December 1997

Works Consulted

Brochure of *Executive Club*, Moscow.
Interview with Elena Tsygankova, Press Secretary of English Club in Moscow, recorded by Helena Goscilo. 5 August 1997.
Litsa. No. 7 (July 1997); No. 8 (August 1997).
"Stenogramma zasedaniia Diskussionnogo kluba: 'Psikhologiya povenediia novogo russiiskogo predprinimatelia.' Moscow: "Ekzek'iativ klub" (23 October 1997).

18 Brief, informal exchanges conducted by Helena Goscilo in August 1997.